

BLASCO ARTICLE REVIEW

Topic's Significance

Significance of the article to arts education and particularly to the integration of the arts into education.

The article has great significance for the integration of the arts into education. It focuses on the use of movie clips in both medical education and other educational settings. It is also significant because it describes educational activities that take place in Brazil.

Theoretical Framework

Review of literature provides a clear framework for interpreting/analyzing/describing the project.

The theoretical framework is insufficiently developed. The literature review is somewhat scattered. The main theoretical foundation for this work seems to derive from educational concepts involving the use of emotion in learning. But I think a stronger case could be made for precisely how emotions serve to emphasize and enhance learning about values, attitudes, beliefs, and identity. It would be extremely helpful to have a better understanding regarding the specific types of topics and issues that such teaching addresses, and exactly how the emotions activated in learners as a result of viewing the movie clips deepens this learning – i.e., what sorts of values, attitudes, beliefs are explored through this teaching approach? Further, it is not clear to me whether the purpose is to help learners become more aware of their own emotions; or to somehow use learner emotions to facilitate engagement around value and attitude questions; or both. Although it seems a central point, I could not fully grasp the line of reasoning regarding the role of emotions in this learning process. As well, I don't understand exactly how activating emotions is a "shortcut to learning," although I find this idea intriguing. More should be said here. Another claim made is that "the best teaching is both an intellectual creation and a performing art." Again, this is a very interesting statement, but needs at least more theoretical and perhaps more empirical support. There is the idea in the article that "excellent teachers" are engaged in self-reflection. There is a large literature addressing this point, but it is not cited. The point itself is not clearly linked to the points about affective education. A lot of these concerns have to do with the organizational shortcomings of the paper. Later, there is some discussion of how movies can help illuminate "daily activities" of learners. I think this has to do with connecting what is portrayed in the movie clips to the actual lives of learners, but once again this is too vague and insubstantial. What aspects of their lives? Overall, interesting and valuable points are made, but they could be both more systematically organized; and then better developed.

Research Design and Methods

If applicable, the article clearly describes methods of selection, in-depth description of data collection procedures and how those procedures matched the research questions, ethical considerations (including verification of IRB approval); and the researcher's role in the study.

This is a descriptive article. However it could benefit from a clear description of the method used (film clips), the target audiences, the role of the instructor etc. All of this presently is somewhat vague and unclear.

Since this is not a research article, the section on qualitative research was rather puzzling. It seems as though the authors wish to reprise or refer to previously reported findings, which might be valuable, but they need to state clearly what their purpose is in doing so and how it builds on earlier research.

Interpretation/Analysis/Description

Clearly outlines the project and/or research analysis

It is very confusing to grasp the project (actually, I believe it is several projects) being described. One project seems to be the use of movie clips with medical students. Another project appears to be using movie clips with other learners (high school, undergraduate?). A third project seems to be faculty development for instructors (from various backgrounds?), training them in the use of movie clips in their own educational settings. Learners from different countries and of different nationalities seem to have been involved in this teaching, which is very interesting. However, there is a rather (to me) stereotypical statement about the "emotionality" of Latin learners, which should be clarified or justified. In any case, each of these different groups of learners should be clearly described; and experiences with different types of learners compared and contrasted. Also, it seems to me that sessions with learners would be quite different from faculty development sessions, and that the approaches in these different contexts should be clarified.

The methodology itself of movie clips is not sufficiently described, in particular how movie clips are selected; and the rationale for grouping different clips together. There is also some rather technical information included about using English language movies with learners from different ethnic, linguistic, and cultural backgrounds. This is an interesting point, but I think would be improved by being addressed more theoretically.

Another important point that is sort of lost in the paper is how viewing the clips can lead learners to move from reflection to behavior. But I don't see clearly how this happens. What is it in the methodology that facilitates this transition? Are learners encouraged to discuss how they intend to apply insights to their personal lives?

Maybe an example of a series of clips, the issues they're intended to raise, how instructor commentary supplements the clips, and how learner discussion proceeds would help concretize this method of teaching.

Organization/Quality of Writing/Presentation

The writing suffers from the fact that English is not the first language of the authors. In addition, the paper needs major reorganization. There are many intriguing ideas in the paper, but there is insufficient structure and an insufficiency of logical development. I would actually recommend an outline of major points, supporting points, and examples, to make sure there is a strong spine that guides the reader.

Contributions to the Field/Appropriateness and Overall Interest for this Audience

Potentially, this article holds great interest to the journal's readership. It highlights an established methodology that has been tested over decades of fieldwork that specifically uses an art form (clips from movies) to teach about identity, personal and professional development, and attitudes, values, and beliefs. However, significant work will be required before the article's potential is realized.

Overall Recommendation:

Accept _____

Accept with Revisions **Major revision** _____