

FM REVIEW 2009-2012 1

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: I think there is likely an amazing story here somewhere, but it does not come across in this telling. I've tried to point authors in the right direction, while encouraging them that we really are interested in what they have to say.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Dear, we are very interested in your manuscript, but feel that, as currently written, it is not quite right for the narrative essay section of the journal. Narrative essays are intended to tell a personal story, to engage readers on an emotional as well as an intellectual level, and to inspire reflection and thought. We suspect that you have a moving and valuable story to tell, but we would like to request that you rewrite your submission to make these qualities more evident.

Please bring us into your world by helping us imagine and visualize the experiences you shared that put the young platoon leader on the path to family medicine. For example, was there a particular patient or a particular experience you could share that might crystallize for the reader the power of the time you spent together in the aid station? Dr. Hawkins, would you be willing to help us understand better how the difficult experiences you had in the field, while in patrol, influenced your determination to become a physician? You are both describing circumstances that, regrettably, are still very remote to most Americans. Therefore, we rely on you to bring them to life for the readers, so we can comprehend even a little what these experiences were like and how they connect with your path as a family physician.

The points the essay makes about treating a wide spectrum of problems, the physician as educator, the teamwork essential to the practice of contemporary medicine, and the value of longterm mentorship are all important, and could easily be woven into the somewhat more personal essay we are envisioning.

We hope you will consider a revision of this manuscript. We would very much like the opportunity to have your perspective represented in the journal.