

## **FM REVIEW 2015 6 COMMENTS**

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR:** This essay by a medical student is fairly well-written and addresses in a heartfelt, humanistic manner the challenge of "collecting" interesting physical findings from patients. The author identifies a widespread phenomenon and the essay reflects well the conflicted experience of many students who both want to advance their learning and still act in compassionate, caring ways that acknowledge the humanity of their patients. The issue of concern is whether or not it adds anything new to the conversation, and two of the three reviewers felt it did not. Although I personally liked the essay, I'm inclined to agree with them. It is a hard balance to strike, because we want to encourage medical students to reflect on these questions, yet because of their level of training they may not have the sophistication or insight to impress seasoned faculty. In this case, regrettably, my opinion is that the appropriate course of action is to reject.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR:** Thank you for this well-written essay (with a clever title!), which addresses in a heartfelt, humanistic manner the challenge for many third year medical students of "collecting" interesting physical findings from patients. You identify a widespread phenomenon and your essay reflects well the conflicted experience of many students who both want to advance their learning and still act in compassionate, caring ways that acknowledge the humanity of their patients. Unfortunately, on the whole reviewers felt that it did not add a sufficiently new perspective to the conversation and did not go into sufficient depth regarding your relationship with the patient.

We commend your initiative to reflect on this important topic. We encourage you to keep writing and thinking about such issues.