

## FM REVIEW 2015 27 COMMENTS

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR:** These 4 55 word stories won Honorable Mention in the STFM Writing Contest. The reviews were quite split, but I agree with reviewer 2, and on the whole thought the writing was good. The 55 word form is hard to do well, and in my judgment the author has turned out 4 rather lovely moments in the evolution of a family doctor. I made a few specific suggestions below.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR:** The 55 word form is a challenging one, and you have done a good job in controlling it in these 4 story/poems. I like the way each captures a different aspect of being a family doctor. Please pay special attention to the comments of reviewer 2. I agree with her assessment that the 4th story in particular is in need of a bit more tweaking. I am not sure she realizes that you are working within the 55 word form, so of course you will need to take this into consideration in your rewriting. "Nice" is bland - can you create more enthusiasm or interest? "I think I'd like that." "That would be a relief." I disagree with reviewer 1 that your language is not sufficiently "poetic" - first, the 55 word story is not technically a poem; secondly, not all poetry has to be rooted in figurative language and metaphor. I liked the down-to-earth approach you employed, which to me was reminiscent of exactly how patients, family members, and residents speak. However, please change the title! The prompt seems rather an odd introduction (and an unnecessary one) to your work.

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR II:** These 55 word linked stories capture moving clinical moments of the author as resident, practicing clinician, teacher, and a doctor anticipating the future. The rewrites undertaken by the author are good, and follow the suggestions of reviewer 2 and the assistant editor. I am still not enthusiastic about the title; and there is an illogicality in the last story as a result of the verb tense. Once the author corrects these minor problems, this will make an excellent contribution to the journal.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II:** Thank you very much for your revisions of stories 1 and 4, both substantially improve the quality of these 55 word pieces. I also am impressed all over again by the way you've linked these 4 - very creative. Two minor points that we'd like you to address:

1) Title: While your current title is better than the instructional title (:-)), its use of three abstract concepts is somewhat at odds with the vivid particulars of the stories themselves. At first I thought you might be providing a word to describe each story, but since there are 3 words and 4 stories, this did not make sense either. Please consider another title - "A Life in Medicine"? "My Medical Journey"? "Stories from My Patients"?

2) In the last story, it doesn't make sense that, although this story takes place in the future, your reaction is expressed in the past tense: "I smiled... I heard." It would work better if you say instead (future tense) "I'll smile when I hear..." or even present tense (i.e., imagining the future) "I smile when I hear..."

**These 55 word stories capture moving clinical moments at different stages of your professional life. Thank you for sharing them.**

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR III: The author has done an excellent job of minor revisions - changing the title and clarifying some inconsistencies in the final piece. In my opinion, 55 word stories are a really hard form to use well. This author has written 4 linked stories that capture well what life in family medicine is like, and that do so with simple yet compelling imagery that every student, resident, and clinician can relate to. Please accept!**

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR III: Your title is perfect, you are absolutely right, this is your life in family medicine, and this title ties the stories together beautifully. The last story now reads very well - I like the immediacy of the present tense. In my opinion, 55 word stories are a really hard form to use well. You've written 4 linked stories that capture very well what life in family medicine is like through simple yet compelling imagery that every student, resident, and clinician will relate to. I love these!**