

FM REVIEW 2015 28 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This is a brief essay written by a Pakistani medical student who questions how he can continue his pursuit of this healing profession in the midst of so much violence, death, and destruction in his country. The opinions of reviewers diverged greatly, as is often the case. Nevertheless, I believe this young author deserves a chance to have his voice heard. We in the West, and we in family medicine, rarely have this opportunity, and I am profoundly moved by this young man reaching out across cultures and history to find common ground. I agree with criticisms that the tone, especially in the concluding paragraphs, is preachy and opinionated, but I think this problem can be remedied.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Thank you for your passionate essay, seeking to identify the meaning behind studying medicine in the context of so much violence, death, and destruction. We believe the essay has potential, but would like you to go a little deeper. Please keep in mind the criticism of reviewer 2 that it is probably less the "doctor" in each of us and more the "humanity" in each of us that allows hope to rise and enables us to go forward. Maybe you can share your philosophy of what being a doctor means. Also, the narrative essays are intended to be personal reflections, not opinion pieces or exhortations. They should tell a personal story. Please rewrite the concluding two paragraphs so that they are less a global call to , and more a statement of personal commitment. Along these lines, it would also improve the essay if you could include something more of your personal story - how you came to pursue medicine, what you hope to achieve in your country through the practice of medicine.

Finally, although you write well, please avoid fragment sentences.