

FM REVIEW 2016 14 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: Dr. Fogleman submitted two poems. We received 3 thoughtful reviews. Based on these reviews, I recommend that we reject the poem "X" and offer suggestions for revisions of "Y." I've made specific recommendations in Comments to the Author.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Thank you for these poems, which reflect on different aspects of clinical medicine. Although we liked both poems, we think "Ephemeral" is the weaker of the two and are not able to accept it.

Reviewers agreed that the blending of art and medicine in "Healing Art" was for the most part very skillfully done. However, they also agreed that the third stanza of this poem needs some work. In particular, for consistency and also to help out the reader, please identify Van Gogh as the artist referenced. Also, stuffing three of his poems into this final stanza seems excessive, and you could probably make your truly lovely point of transcendence through Starry Night alone. The progression in the poem from patient to patient to physician is exquisite, and in contrast to reviewer 2, I think the "problem" is well-defined ("the weight of encumbered spirits"), as is the healing power of art as found in "Starry Night," although I agree with reviewer 1 that you need to offer some detail about this painting just as you did about Ansel Adams and about O'Keefe.

Although reviewer 2 was puzzled by the Ansel Adams line, I favor reviewer 1's reveling in its ambiguity. I am very happy to have you leave this line alone, unless for some reason you wish to change it.

Reviewer 3 offers some excellent editorial suggestions. In particular, please consider a rewrite of the phrase "tears to dry eyes," which could be crafted in a more original manner; please also consider switching "attending" (rather specialized term) to "physician"; look at eliminating line 4, stanza 2, as unnecessary; I also favor the use of the word "carrying" vs. "sharing" so please revisit this; and finally, please look carefully at the line breaks recommended in the third stanza.

With some minor revisions, this will be a compelling and emotionally evocative poem which we expect will move readers and remind them of the artistry inherent in medicine.