

FM REVIEW 2017 2 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This essay pays tribute to the narrator's physician-mentor. It is really well-written and is very effective in conveying the wisdom and endearing mannerisms of someone who sounds like a truly outstanding teacher and role model. However, both reviewers recommend reject, which is highly unusual, and I tend to agree with them. This kind of encomium is highly specific to a single individual. While the lessons this physician has imparted to his mentees are wise and insightful, there is no real story here.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: This is a beautiful tribute to your mentor. He sounds like a truly extraordinary teacher and role model, wise, insightful, with endearing mannerisms and a profound commitment to doing good by his patients and learners. Your skillful portrayal made him come to vivid life. Unfortunately, we've concluded that the piece is too specific to this individual to merit publication in the journal. While it is full of valuable clinical lessons, it does not really tell a story, one of the requirements of a narrative essay. You are a wonderful writer, and we would love to see more of your work submitted to Family Medicine.