

FM REVIEW 2017 4 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This poem describes experiences of an intern shifting between the ICU and clinic. Reviewer 1 found the style choppy and wanted better flow. I tend to agree with Reviewer 2 that on the whole the poem is well written, and that its terse style mirrors both ICU and clinic encounters. Reviewer 1's major criticism is that the poem seems to imply that the ICU patient is more "known" than the clinic patient, which I do not believe is the author's intent. I am recommending that the author address this issue; as well as make a few minor modifications in writing style. This is a solid poem by a good writer that could be made just a bit better.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: This is a well-written and well observed poem. While the contrasts between ICU and clinic are striking, their challenges, although different, are both significant. This brings us to the main critique of the poem: are you saying that the ICU patient is better known than the clinic patient? Or rather that it is clearer how to manage this patient. I think the latter: one of the interesting twists of the poem is that it suggests you have an opportunity to "know" your clinic patient in a way that is not possible in the ICU, and this makes clinic both more difficult and perhaps more rewarding. In any case, please think of a way to clarify this point, as it goes to the heart of the poem.

Other criticisms are purely stylistic. I recommend that you do not use prose punctuation since you have several sentence fragments that are not well-served by a period. There is also a voice change in the first stanza that I request you reconsider. To me, one point you're making is that there is more emotional distance between you and the ICU patient than between you and the clinic patient; and one way you convey this is by speaking of the ICU patient in third person, and the clinic patient in second person. With this in mind, please revisit the voice shift in the first stanza and consider whether this should remain in third person. Finally, despite the title, I think you could use a bit more of a transition from ICU to clinic.

I've attached an edited version with some comments and suggestions. Please revise in your own voice, while taking into consideration these points.

You are a strong writer, and it is a pleasure to see your ability to capture the many emotions of the intern experience in this poem.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR III: The author has made suggested minor changes. The poem reads very well now, and makes a really intriguing point that it may be harder in some respects to manage patients in the outpatient clinic than in the ICU because of the ambiguity and lack of certainty involved in defining the problem to be addressed. This poem will make a really good contribution to the journal.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR III: Thank you for these exceedingly minor changes, which nevertheless add to the clarity and readability of this insightful and well-observed poem.