

FM REVIEW 2018 23 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This is a touching essay about a medical student dealing with her mother's cancer. It is primarily about what the student learns as a person and a future physician from her mother's experience. It is also partly about how hard it is to be both a medical student and a daughter or son of a seriously ill individual with the burden of extra knowledge that this dual role brings; partly about how important it is to see things from the patient's perspective; and partly about the courage of the mom. These are all important insights for the author. The question however is whether they are important insights for the journal's readership of experienced clinicians and medical educators. On the whole, I regret to say that I think they are not. Frankly, what I found most valuable was the reminder as a faculty member that while our students are taking exams and studying for tests, some of them may be dealing with traumatic personal issues. However, this is not the focus of the essay and I do not think it is an essay this author would want to write. It certainly wouldn't hurt to send the essay out for review to solicit additional reactions from potential readers, but I would probably lean toward rejecting. I agree that the final paragraph, although really heartwrenching, does not belong in this essay at all.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: This is a touching essay about your dealing with your mother's cancer as a medical student. In my read, it is primarily about what you have learned as a person and also as a future physician from undergoing this very difficult experience. It is also partly about how hard it is to be both a medical student and a daughter of a seriously ill individual because of the burden of additional knowledge that this dual role brings. It is also about how important it is to see things from the patient's perspective. And finally, it is a moving tribute to the courage of your mom. These are all important insights for you to have achieved, and you express them poignantly and well. Unfortunately, however, it is my job to consider the journal's audience, which is experienced family physicians and medical educators. These insights may be more familiar to this group. I think this is a strong essay, but encourage you to pursue publication in a journal such as Hospital Drive or Blood and Thunder which has a broader audience