

## FM REVIEW 2019 21 COMMENTS

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR:** This is a well-written essay describing a third-year resident's struggle as to whether he was "comfortable" delivering an attending's baby. In the end, he realizes that it is not about resident delivering attending, but doctor being fully engaged and present for his patient. It's an interesting issue, which we have rarely addressed, and reviewers liked it. There are some minor concerns about clarity, and disagreement over the opening and closing paragraphs, but overall this will make for an excellent essay.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR:** Thank you for this well-written essay on a very interesting topic that is not often addressed. The divide between resident and attending is an intriguing, ill-defined, and porous one, as you discovered. Your reflections on one specific instance shed light on how and when the boundary can and should be crossed.

We would like you to consider a few minor revisions:

1) There was some disagreement about your introductory paragraph, with reviewer 3 feeling it was not a good fit, but reviewer 1 liking it. To me it was clear that the narrative arc is moving from an assumption of a divide to the realization that the doctor-patient relationship takes precedence over the resident-attending relationship. But please consider reworking this to take into consideration reviewer 3's comments.

2) Reviewer 3 also felt the concluding paragraph was weak. I think it could be enlivened by actually describing some aspect of the delivery, rather than just telling us what it was like for you. Otherwise, it makes its point.

3) Reviewer 1 is concerned that it is not clear why you were initially hesitant to take on this patient; or why you changed your mind. Again, to me this is the heart of the essay, and is presented clearly. However, take a look both at when you initially decline; and when you decide to plunge in and perhaps add a sentence underlining your motivation in each case.

4) Reviewer 2 makes the excellent point that good narrative is propelled by our seeing through your eyes and feeling through your heart. The best way to accomplish this is through showing, not telling. Please look for ways of adding immediacy to the narrative. For example, rather than saying "...asked them myself if they would allow me to take part in their delivery. They, of course, were more than happy about this..." you could say, "The warmth of their smiles and the eagerness with which they welcomed me was a kind of homecoming for me as a doctor." (in your own words).

In addition, please look at the attached for a few stylistic changes.

We look forward to reviewing a revised manuscript.

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR II:** This is a really interesting and well-written essay from a resident who has to deliver the baby of an attending. It addresses in a thoughtful and engaging manner the gulf that residents often feel separates them from the rarified attending world.

The author has done a superb revision. It perfectly addresses the reviewer and editor suggestions, and includes more memorable imagery, more vivid depictions of emotion, and is altogether more humanizing of the author. I am suggesting some very minor revisions, most of which could be handled in copy-editing, but because I am requesting that the author remove or revise two sentences, I feel he should be the one to decide on their final shape.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II:** These revisions perfectly address reviewers' and editor suggestions by including more memorable imagery, more vivid depictions of emotion, and more vulnerability and humor. These small but meaningful changes all serve to humanize the text. I am suggesting some very minor revisions, most of which could be handled in copy-editing, but because I am requesting that you remove or revise two entire sentences, I feel you should be the one to decide on their final shape.

Please know that you've written a really interesting essay that addresses in a thoughtful and engaging manner the gulf that residents often feel separates them from the rarified attending world. We are eager to see it in the journal and think it will be a great value to our readers.

**RECOMMENDED MINOR REVISIONS:**

p. 3, line 32 "I had run to codes with a lower heartrate..." remove "to"

p. 4, line 36 Remove "Therefore" unnecessary

p. 4, last line "This driving force is the same as that which commits myself..." This entire sentence could be deleted (This sentence about quality improvement projects is not too pertinent and detracts from the momentum of the essay)

p. 5 line 3, "That drive came forth as..." could be deleted and start with "I realized..." as originally written.

p. 5 line 20, "thinking of them as my attendings AND myself as their resident..." Add "and" between "attending " and "myself"

p. 5 line 34 "warm invitations to me, and rarely have I seen..." Change to "warm invitations to me. Rarely have I seen..."

p. 5 line 41 "animated mentor and soon-to-be father, eventually delivering..." Add comma after "father."

p. 5 line 43 "parents arms." Add apostrophe after "parents".

p. 5 line 43 Please reword something similar. The sentence as written is a bit cumbersome: "On reflection, a smile comes to my face and I marvel at the blend of teaching, learning..."

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR III:** In this revision, I requested very minor stylistic and grammatical changes, but sufficient in quantity that I thought they should be addressed outside the standard copyediting process. The author has made all changes requested. This essay presents a very interesting perspective on the perceived gap between residents and attendings and how this can quickly close in patient care. I definitely recommend publication.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR III:** Thank you for so conscientiously addressing these very minor changes. Your essay reads very well, presents a very interesting perspective on the perceived gap between residents and attendings and how this can quickly close in patient care, and is very involving and moving. Thank you for choosing to submit your work to our journal.